A Dream Deferred: The politics, promise, and pitfalls of American education

Spring 2022
Wednesdays, 12:45-2:45 pm

Dr. Sarah James

Office: CGIS S223
Email: sarahjames@g.harvard.edu
Office hours: Tuesdays 1-3pm (virtual at https://harvard.zoom.us/j/9232449589) & Wednesdays 2:45-4:00pm (in person in CGIS cafe). You can sign up for office hours at bit.ly/SEJCal
Course website: https://canvas.harvard.edu/courses/101880

COURSE OVERVIEW
The heralded story of American education is that it is the gateway to the American dream, and that those who invest in education can achieve greater financial, political, and social power. Yet American public education started as a fundamentally unequal institution, mostly limited to white propertied young men. Unequal access to an excellent education continues today. This course explores the roots of this system, its role in creating and addressing racial and economic inequality, and how and why partisan politics influences the design of American education policy. Specifically, we will examine the following essential questions:

• What are the goals of American public education? What should they be and how have ideas about this question changed over time?
• Why has a seemingly universal goal of providing access to learning been so contentious at various points in American political history?
• What role have different actors played in instigating change or protecting the status quo?
• What features of American political institutions have exacerbated inequalities or spurred equitable innovation?

Our purpose in this class is three-fold:

• First, we will engage in respectful, evidence-based, and moving discussion about education, race, power, and politics to develop answers to our essential questions.
• Second, we will examine and apply foundational concepts from political science to understand and evaluate debates, developments, and ethical questions in education policy.
• Third, we will learn to efficiently and precisely conduct social science research. This includes improving our ability to write convincingly and concisely about our findings for both scholarly and practical audiences. This is intended as preparation for writing a senior thesis.

Our course is divided into four parts. In the first unit (Promises), we will lay important theoretical groundwork for the remainder of the course by examining different perspectives on the role that education can and should play in the American democracy. Second (Politics), we will explore the different actors and institutions that have had influenced the design and politics of American education. Third, we will turn to the ways in which education in America has both lived up to and fallen short of the lofty goals ascribed to it (Promises and Pitfalls). And finally, in our fourth and final unit (Promises or Pitfalls) students will have the opportunity to choose two specific policy areas or solutions to education inequality for us to examine. We will look at the origins of the ideas and how their implementation has played out and how the policy has changed the politics of education.

We will begin each class with discussion and application of the readings, followed by a brief break, and conclude each day with a mini lesson on how to conduct research and write coherently for social scientists. This time may also include workshopping and peer review opportunities for students to share challenges and successes and get feedback on their progress.

ASSIGNMENTS & GRADING
There are two types of assignments in this course: reflections on the readings each week and a final project, which can be either a policy analysis and proposal or a research style seminar paper.
Reading reflections are worth 40% of the overall grade and the various research assignments are worth 60%. For the reading reflections, students may decide what combination of short and long reflections they would like to complete such that the total possible points they have earned adds up to 40 points (i.e., 8 short reflections or 4 long reflections or 4 short reflections and 2 long reflections). **Reading reflections are due by 8am the day we have class.**

Students may also choose how to earn the other 60% from their final project: through meeting more or fewer incremental deadlines. Students will also have the opportunity to choose the type of final paper they write—either a traditional seminar research paper or a policy proposal. Students planning to write a senior thesis should strongly consider the research paper. We will spend a portion of most sessions learning about the different aspects of conducting social science research and writing about our findings. More detailed descriptions of each assignment and the rubrics I will use to score them are available on Canvas and will be discussed in class.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Assignment Type</th>
<th>Options</th>
<th>Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Reading reflections (total points should amount to 40)</td>
<td><strong>Short reflection</strong>&lt;br&gt;2-3 sentence summary of each reading AND 2-3 questions or comments about themes or confusions across the readings.</td>
<td>5% each</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>In-depth reflection</strong>&lt;br&gt;3-4 page reflection that identifies key themes from the readings, articulating how the readings either connect or contradict one another and other ideas from the course</td>
<td>10% each</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research or Policy Paper (see rubric for grading criteria)</td>
<td><strong>More structured, more feedback</strong>&lt;br&gt;Research question paper (due 2/25/22)</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Contextualization paper (due 3/25/22)</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>First draft (due no later than 4/15/22)</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Final draft (due date dependent on exam schedule)</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>More autonomy, fewer feedback opportunities</strong>&lt;br&gt;Research question paper (due 2/25/22)</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Contextualization paper (due no later than 3/25/22)</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Final paper (due date dependent on exam schedule)</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Late assignments**

All students who are working individually on their final project may have an automatic 24-hour extension on any final project assignment. Students should let me know before the stated deadline if they tend to take advantage of the extension (note this is not intended to be a request for permission to use the extension—you should just assume you have the extension if you need it). I expect submissions from groups to be submitted on time, unless we have discussed alternatives at least 72 hours in advance of the deadline.

**A note about participation**

I believe that students can contribute in a myriad of ways: writing excellent reflection papers, asking questions of their peers, raising their hand in class, attending office hours, and reaching out to the instructor via email, just to name a few. Contributing to the intellectual dialogue and conversations in our class is a foundational expectation of the course but is not explicitly included in the grading scheme because of how subjective assessing participation can be. I will touch base with students if I am concerned about their engagement in the course, but otherwise trust that students will do their best to contribute to our collective learning when and how they are most excited about doing so. This being said, **attendance at our weekly seminars is mandatory; students who miss multiple sessions without documented rationale may lose up to 5 points off their final grade. Laptops and cell phones are permitted, but only to reference the readings, not for notetaking; there should be no typing happening. If they are distracting, I will ban them.**
STATEMENT OF INCLUSION & BELONGING

One of the goals of this class is to use social science research to ground conversations about education, values, politics, race and inequality, but this approach does not remove the passion, emotion, and challenge of having such conversations. Furthermore, we all interpret findings through the lenses of our own experiences, be it ideological, racial, regional, or economic (to name a few). I have done my best to include a diverse set of perspectives; however, I acknowledge that it is possible there may be both overt and covert biases in the material, due to both the lens through which much of political science and journalism is written and through my own biases when choosing materials.

We will discuss topics that may generate strong personal and emotional reactions. Our conversations will not always be easy; we will make mistakes in our speaking and our listening; sometimes we will need patience or courage or imagination or any number of qualities in combination to engage our texts, our classmates, and our own ideas and experiences. We will always need respect for others. Thus, an additional aim of our course necessarily will be for us to increase our facility with the sometimes-difficult conversations that arise as we deepen our understandings of multiple perspectives. While our intention may not be to cause discomfort or offense, the impact of what happens throughout the course is not to be ignored and is something that I consider to be very important and deserving of attention. If and when this occurs, there are several ways to address it:

1. Discuss the situation privately with me. I am always open to listening to students' experiences and want to work with students to find acceptable ways to process and address the issue.
2. Discuss the situation with the class. Starting by asking a question from a position of assuming the best about the speaker's intentions can be a useful strategy for bringing something to the class' attention. Chances are there is at least one other student in the class who had a similar response to the material. Discussion enhances the ability for all class participants to have a fuller understanding of context and impact of course material and class discussions.
3. If for any reason you do not feel comfortable discussing the issue directly with me, I encourage you to speak with one of your resident advisors.

COURSE SCHEDULE & READINGS

We will read between 120 and 250 pages each week. Note that the course intentionally starts with a heavier reading load and lightens up as the semester goes along to allow for students to shift their focus to the final project. Be sure to check each citation for any specifics on which chapters or pages to focus on. At the end of each class, I will preview the following week’s readings and offer suggestions on what can be skimmed vs. what should be read in detail.

PART I: PROMISE

What is the role of education in American democracy? How should educators and policymakers balance the needs of individuals with the collective?

January 26: Purpose of Education for Society

What is the role of education in a liberal democracy? Who has defined this purpose and how has it changed over time?

Skill: The arc of research

Theoretical purpose


Historical purpose


Feldman, Joe. Grading for equity: What it is, why it matters, and how it can transform schools and classrooms. Corwin Press, 2018., Chapter 2: A brief history of grading

February 2: Purpose of education for the individual
How should schools balance the needs of individuals with the needs of the collective (be in the community or society)? Whose needs should be prioritized in a school setting (i.e., the lowest or highest achieving? Those meeting expectations? Students with the fewest resources?)?

Skill: The two types of research questions and how to write them

Overview

Specific purposes


Specific subgroups


PART II: POLITICS
What role does federalism play in the design and implementation of American education policy and politics?
What powers does each level of government have over education policy?
Which actors are most powerful in education politics?

February 9: Executive and federal power
In what ways has the executive branch influenced education policy? How has this changed over time?
Skill: Finding scholarly resources & staying organized while researching

Overview of executive power


Common Core as an example of executive power in education


Tampio, Nicholas. 2016. “A Democratic Critique of the Common Core English Language Arts (ELA) Standards.” *Democracy and Education*. 26(1)

**February 16: State Power**

*What role do the states play in designing and regulating education? How much power should states have?*

*Skill: Overviewing social science methods*

**Theoretical framework**


**Specific examples of state power**


**February 23: Local Power and School Boards**

*What are the benefits and disadvantages of local control over schools? Should school boards be appointed or elected?*

*Skill: Workshop research questions*

**Local electoral politics in education**


**The politicization of school boards**


March 2: Parents and policy entrepreneurs
What levers of power do parents have over schools and education policy? Under what conditions do they exercise this power? How have policy entrepreneurs influenced education policy? How has this changed over time?
Skill: The why behind contextualizing research

Theoretical concepts
Gutmann, Amy. Democratic Education, “Parental Choice,” pages 64-70, 115-122

Historical Examples

March 9: Unions
What are teacher unions and what purpose do they serve? How have teacher unions impacted the development of education politics and reform?
Skill: How to effectively incorporate other scholarly sources (aka contextualizing your research aka writing a literature review)

Political power and purpose of unions

Impact of unions in education
PART III: PROMISES AND PITFALLS
When and how have schools been cites of communicating and enforcing racial, social, and cultural hierarchies? In what ways has education become more equitable? Less equitable? Under what conditions do more equitable education policies get passed and implemented?

March 23: Schools as tools of oppression
When and how have schools been cites of communicating and enforcing racial, social, and cultural hierarchies? How has this changed, if at all?

Skill: Using evidence in research papers (aka when to use primary and secondary sources)


Love, Bettina L. We want to do more than survive: Abolitionist teaching and the pursuit of educational freedom. Beacon Press, 2019. Chapters 3 & 4 XX


March 30: Desegregation and resegregation
What has the trajectory of desegregation in the US been? What factors have accelerated and blocked changes in the racial make-up of schools?

Skill: Citations


Frankenberg, Erica, Ee, Jongyeon, Ayscue, Jennifer B. and Orfield, Gary. 2019. Harming our Common Future: America's Segregated Schools 65 Years After Brown. UCLA's Civil Rights Project


April 6: Exit and Integration
What role does “exit” play in American education? Should integration be a goal of public education? If so, how should we achieve this?

Skill: Quoting, paraphrasing, and summarizing

Theoretical frame

Examples


April 13: The role of higher education
What responsibilities does higher ed have in addressing inequities in American education? Does the structure of American higher education address or exacerbate inequality in education?
Skill: Writers’ workshop


Chetty, XX. Determinants of Income Segregation and Intergenerational Mobility Across Colleges


PART IV: PROMISE OR PITFALL? (Student choice on two topics)

April 20: Student Choice 1
Skill: Deep dive on introductions & conclusions

April 26: Student Choice 2 and wrap up
Skill: Writers’ workshop

Option 1: Choice & Charters
To what extent are charter schools and expanded parent choice a solution to the challenges of inequality facing public education? How have the justifications for charters and choice changed over time? Who benefits and who is disadvantaged by choice?


http://la.utexas.edu/users/heleaver/330T/350kPEEFriedmanRoleOfGovttable.pdf. You can skip the section on vocational education.


Moe, Terry M. The politics of institutional reform: Katrina, education, and the second face of power. Cambridge University Press, 2019. 1-6 and 66-162 (Feel free to skim pages 129-162 if you are short on time – be sure to get to the readings below). XX

**Option 2: Teaching Corps**

What are the justifications for a teaching corps? Does bringing people into teaching temporarily hinder or address educational inequality? What are the racial implications of a teaching corps model?

Kopp, Wendy. *One day, all children...: The unlikely triumph of Teach for America and what I learned along the way.* PublicAffairs, 2008.


**Option 3: No excuses and school discipline**

What were the origins of no excuses school discipline? What are the justifications for such systems? How have these justifications changed over time?


**Option 4: Accountability and high stakes testing**

How did public officials justify the need for high stakes testing? What problems was accountability supposed to solve? How has the approach to and arguments against accountability changed over time?


Garrison, Mark J. A measure of failure: The political origins of standardized testing. SUNy Press, 2009. Chapters TBD